

APPLICATION NO.	P21/V1379/LB
SITE	Foxcombe Hall Boars Hill Oxford, OX1 5HR
PARISH	WOOTTON
PROPOSAL	Change of use from a non-residential educational institution (use class F1(a)) to a residential university campus (use class C2), the demolition of the Old Laboratory building and ancillary buildings. Internal and external alterations to listed building. Redevelopment and extension to include 60 student bedrooms, dining hall, campus cafe/shop, gym, extension to lecture theatre, teaching space and study space and associated external works. (as amended plans received 24 November 2021).
WARD MEMBERS	Debby Hallett Emily Smith Val Shaw
APPLICANT OFFICER	PHBS UK Penny Silverwood

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that Listed Building Consent is granted subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Time limit for commencement**
- 2. Approved plans**
- 3. Photographic schedule of materials**

1.0 INTRODUCTION AND PROPOSAL

- 1.1** This application is presented to Planning Committee due to a call-in request from Councillor Val Shaw.
- 1.2** The application relates to the buildings and grounds of Foxcombe Hall on Boars Hill, which is the campus of Peking University HSBC Business School (PHBS UK). The site lies to the south of Berkeley Road and to the south-east of Jarn Way. The buildings and car parks are located on the northern part of the site close to adjacent roads. The southern part of the site is mainly extensive woodland with a large pond.

1.3 Foxcombe Hall, the North Gateway and the Garden Terraces and Structures to the south are Grade II listed, first listed in 2017 for their architectural and historic interest. The following structures and features on site were explicitly excluded from curtilage listing by Historic England in their assessment of the site:

- North wing of 1964
- The square apse and the east end of the hall
- The 1977 extension of the north wing to the south and east (incorporating the modern entrance) and the link to the former billiard room
- The interior of the service wing
- The former garages and the Old Dairy to the NW of the hall.

1.4 The plan below indicates the listed elements of the site in blue:



1.5 *The Proposal*

The overall proposals for the change of use of the site from a non-residential educational institution to a residential university campus, demolition of the old dairy building and re-development and extension of the site to include 60 student bedrooms and facilities are described in the accompanying planning application report (application ref. P21/V/1376/FUL. Listed building consent is sought for internal and external changes works summarised as:

- Demolition of the flat roofed west extension to the service wing
- Internal reconfiguration of the service wing to create a gym at the lower ground floor, new first floor bedrooms, shared kitchen and WCs.
- Additional first floor fire escape within the west wing and removal of external metal fire escape
- Reconfiguration of the Warden's flat in the Tower.

1.6 Consideration of the demolition of the Old Dairy Building; a non-designated heritage asset within the curtilage of the listed building and the effect on the setting of the listed building is covered in the accompanying planning application report for application ref. P21/V1376/FUL.

1.7 Plans of the proposed works to the listed building are **attached** at Appendix 1.

2.0 **SUMMARY OF CONSULTATIONS & REPRESENTATIONS**

2.1 A summary of the responses received to the current proposal is below. A full of all comments received can be seen online at www.whitehorsedc.gov.uk.

Wootton Parish Council	No comments received. Comments received regarding the planning application ref. P21/V1376/FUL are summarised in the report for that application.
Sunningwell Parish Council	<p><u>Second Consultation (November 2021)</u> Objection</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Nothing in the amendments to cause any less concern about the impacts of the proposal and it continues to fail to address the main issues - Change of use to a full-time residential university campus operating 24/7 days a week - The increase in population in a quiet rural area both day and night will have an adverse effect on the local community - Adverse impact on the green belt and wider environmental issues and contrary to the provisions set out in the NPPF - Serious traffic impact and implications and lack of on-site car parking <p><u>First Consultation (May 2021)</u> Objection</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comments objecting to the planning application apply to the listed building application - Can see no reason to alter the important listed buildings only listed in April 2017 for their wealth of architectural detail and building construction importance both externally and internally and to substantially alter any part of them would be destroying something that is irreplaceable and should be preserved at all costs - Altering the buildings achieves no major public benefit and there are no proven exceptional circumstances as to why these buildings need to be altered and no reason why they cannot continue to be used beneficially in their existing state

<p>Residents</p>	<p>Comments from 20 residents objecting to the application have been received which are summarised as:.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Old Dairy Building should not be demolished but should be preserved as a living science museum - The heritage asset can only be destroyed for an exceptional circumstance which has not been provided <p>Comments relating to impact on green belt, traffic impacts, noise pollution, light pollution are not relevant to this application but are summarised in the report for the associated planning application (ref. P21/V1376/FUL).</p> <p>Comments from five residents in support of the application have also been received. Comments relate to the benefits for students, improvements to educational infrastructure, economic benefits and the improvements to energy efficiency. These are relevant to the associated planning application (ref. P21/V1376/FUL) and have been summarised in the accompanying report for that application.</p>
<p>Conservation Officer</p>	<p><u>Second Consultation (November 2021)</u> No objection</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Revised plans do not alter previous recommendation <p><u>First Consultation (May 2021) –</u> No objection</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Site comprises the following Grade II listed designated heritage assets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Foxcombe Hall o The North Gateway o The Garden Terraces and Structures to the south - The following structures and features are explicitly excluded from curtilage listing by Historic England in their assessment of the site: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o North wing of 1964 o The square apse and the east end of the hall o The 1977 extension of the north wing to the south and east (incorporates the modern entrance) and the link to the former billiard room o The interior of the service wing (having been remodelled to form offices and modern facilities) o The former garages and the Old Dairy to the NW of the hall. - The internal layout of the service wing within the West Wing is explicitly excluded from the list description and

	<p>the proposed works retain reference to the corridor layout as existing while improving and upgrading the bedroom and kitchenette provision</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Works to create a new fire escape result in the removal of a small area of roof and wall material to create a new doorway junction which does not harm the overall significance of the listed building- The internal changes to the Wardens Flat within the tower are minimal and not considered to harm the historic building- There are no other works proposed to the interiors of the main listed building- The works do not harm the significance of the listed building and its fabric and are in accordance with policy tests. <p><i>Old Dairy Laboratory building</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- The Old Dairy Building is considered to be a non-designated heritage asset under the tests of paragraph 203 of the NPPF being of local historic interest- The Old Dairy building has specific local interest as the former laboratory of 8th Earl Berkeley. This local interest is considered to be in part historic interest due to its specific connection to the 8th Earl Berkeley's tenure at Foxcombe Hall and in part architectural owing to his intention to house a laboratory.- It is one of the earliest buildings on site, original plans were for a large, thatched building in the prevailing character of the outbuildings at the hall at the time. At some point the thatched roof was replaced with a tiled roof. There is no evidence the building was ever intended as a dairy being much larger in footprint than would have been required for such a use.- There is evidence the building was separated from the main house and lodge by a retaining wall and gates, one end of the gate piers survives.- Building was externally designed to respond to the Arts and Crafts style popular at the time and consistent with the later proposals for other elements of the site and extensions to the main house that came in the early C20, although the detailing is not as refined as that on the West Wing or the Lodge.- Internally the layout is a series of rooms off a central spine corridor with no specific internal features that indicate it has a former academic research use. Adaptations have been made for its use as a hostel, officers and training space over the year. Timber paraquet floors are on the ground and basement floor and the principal structure at roof level appears to date from late C19 and early C20.
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- There have been extensive interventions to introduce and alter services throughout the building and the planning history indicates that much of the internal layout and partitioning has changed from the original layout- There are areas where the deterioration of the fabric has occurred, specifically to the lower ground/ basement level where damp levels have severely compromised the floor structure and to the west end where similar damp issues are causing harm to the integrity of the floor.- The detailed heritage assessment submitted provides a historic record of the site and the development of the lab for Berkeley. This assessment provides a more detailed understanding of the site's former owner and the proposals for the lab building than can be understood specifically from the building as existing. It also provides an adequate record of the fabric of the building. It is stylistically consistent with the Arts and Crafts phases of the wider site. It provides a very useful record of the building's historic and architectural interest.- The building is rightly not of high enough Architectural or Historic Interest to have been worthy of statutory listing when the main Hall was listed.- The building proposed to replace it is of a scale intended to make best use of the space available including increasing the basement level to reduce the overall massing.- It would not be possible to accommodate the same amount of proposed accommodation in the existing building without significant extension and alteration to it.- If the principle of new development is acceptable here in planning terms, then no objection to the removal of the former lab building to facilitate it. The supporting documents provide a valuable record of the building's history, association with a person of local historic interest and the remaining fabric of the structure.- Overall, the extant Old Dairy building fabric is not of such high historic or architectural interest that it should be retained and converted.- The documentary research compiled and submitted provides a greater level of detail about the history of the building and wider site than can be understood from the building itself. The condition of the interior is such that much of the primary fabric and legibility of primary plan form would be lost in order to bring the building up to a habitable standard.
--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Loss of the building would alter the existing setting of the listed building but would not harm the significance of the designated heritage asset- The proposed new accommodation block Building A is designed to sit behind the existing site wall along the junction between Berkeley Road and Jarn Way. Although of greater massing than the existing building it has no greater relationship with the exterior of the site than the current built form and would not obscure views towards the Lodge or Tower and the glimpses of the main house that can be experienced from the roads.- The building is designed so that the elevations that are visible in the street scene share traditional pitched roofs and proportions as the other buildings on the site but would be finished in a contemporary style and materials. <p><i>New development</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Proposed buildings A and D are located in the historic service areas of the site and are designed to be architecturally subservient to the main listed building.- The massing is greater than existing outbuildings but the topography of the site has been used to increase the floor space without far exceeding the ridge height of the west wing of the house or the retained lodge.- Building D continues the building line of the existing West Wing in a discreet area of the site.- Building A has a larger massing than the existing Old Dairy but shares a similar relationship to the main house and the site as experienced from Jarn Way and Berkeley Road.- Satisfied that the listed building remains the dominant building on the site and the use of a C21 style for new buildings ensures that the characteristic Arts and Crafts designs of the listed building are not eroded by pastiche or diminished by statement architectural forms that detract from their historic characteristics.- The proposed alterations to Building T are considered a visual improvement on the existing 1990s first floor extensions to the 1964 range that overlook the Berkeley Road above the estate wall. The existing building has a significant visual impact on views of the site from Berkeley Road and shares none of the material detailing or proportions of the other buildings on site- The proposed alterations serve to improve the overall appearance of this area of the site by introducing a more traditional pitched roof to the first-floor element of the 1960s and 1990s extensions that will soften the appearance of this part of the site when views from
--	---

	<p>approaches along Berkeley Road. No objection to the proposed works to Building T.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- The proposed works across the site preserve the prominence of the listed building and the features of its designed setting identified as making the greatest contribution to its significance and historic and architectural interest that make it worthy of statutory listing.- The loss of the former Berkeley Laboratory will change the existing setting of the building, but the fabric of the building is not considered to be of such high historic or architectural interest that there is more that can be learnt from retaining the fabric.- Satisfied that the assessment provided forms an adequate record of its interest as a building- Proposed building A introduces a greater massing into the historically service and ancillary area of the site but the building will remain subservient to the main listed building and is not considered to detract from the architectural or historic interest of the listed building or the contribution that this part of the site makes as part of its setting- From within the site when viewed from the lower ground in the courtyard area surrounding the tower the proposed new landscaping and new building will create a greater sense of enclosure at the north-western end of the site than the existing dairy building. It is not considered that this will detract from the character of this part of the site or the experience of the listed buildings that remain.- Satisfied that the listed building and any features of special architectural or historic interest within it will be preserved by way of this application- There will be an alteration to the setting of the listed building. The proposed removal of the Old Dairy and development of new ancillary structures must be considered with regard to the impact it will have on the contribution this part of the building's setting has on its significance- The use of the area for ancillary functions will preserve the historic associated use of the area as part of the setting to the main Hall however the scale of new development will alter the appearance of this area and result in an intensification of the use of this area- Satisfied under the tests of Chapter 16 of the NPPF that the significance of the heritage assets on the site including non-designated heritage assets are appropriately understood and have been taken into account in assessing these proposals as per paragraphs 194 and 195 of the NPPF.
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- The scheme will result in the loss of a non-designated heritage asset and the intensification of new ancillary development in the setting of the Grade II listed Foxcombe Hall.- Consider the harm to the significance of the listed building would be less-than-substantial as per paragraph 202 of the NPPF resulting from the loss of an ancillary structure of subservient scale and character contemporary to the original listed building that provides some understanding of the development of the listed building and wider site. The harm is not considered to be greater than less-than-substantial as the building is not considered curtilage listed to the main building and its associative value has been adequately record by heritage appraisal.- A low level of harm is also considered to arise from the intensification of built form in this ancillary area which is considered low level because the proposed massing has sought to preserve the dominance of the listed building on the site by remaining physically and materially subservient.- In determining the application, the council should be satisfied that there are demonstrable public benefits that would outweigh the harm identified.- Paragraph 203 of the NPPF requires a balanced judgement to eb taken having regard to the scale of harm or loss to a non-designated heritage asset and its overall significance. Whilst the proposal results in total loss of the asset the application has demonstrated that the remaining building has been considerably altered from its original design as planned by 8th Earl Berkeley from whom it gains much of its local historic interest. The submitted heritage statement provides a very valuable record of the building's history and development in the absence of surviving features within the building itself.- While the scale of loss is high the significance of the remaining building is considered to be low. Overall, the demolition of the former laboratory building results in a moderate level of loss which should be weighted in the balance when decision taking.- Under paragraph 204 of the NPPF the Old Dairy should not granted permission for demolition unless there is a reasonable expectation that the proposed development will be implemented.- The application will preserve the listed fabric of Foxcombe Hall and improve the external appearance of a number of areas of the stie that form part of its setting whilst continuing to provide a viable use for the listed building. Some harm has been identified to the heritage
--	---

	<p>assets which must be weighed in the overall planning balance.</p>
<p>Friends of Boars Hill</p>	<p>The majority of matters raised by this consultee are relevant to the associated planning application ref. P21/V1376/FUL and have been summarised in the accompanying report for that application. Their comments related to heritage impact can be summarised as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The laboratories make an important contribution to the significance and setting of the designated heritage assets of Foxcombe Hall and an indispensable element of the wider settlement - Its demolition will be harmful by the loss of historic fabric per se but its removal will also result in a loss of significance to the setting of the designated heritage assets. The building hosted an important laboratory search function which increases the heritage significance of the building - The demolition of the non-designated heritage asset constitutes a high quantum of harm to the designated heritage asset and its setting
<p>The Victorian Society</p>	<p><u>Second Consultation (November 2021)</u> Objection</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No major changes, previous objection remains - The demolition of the Old Dairy would destroy a non-designated heritage asset and harm the setting of a listed building. The redevelopment of this part of the site with three new buildings would also add to this harm - The scale of development is inappropriate for the site and would harm the listed buildings and their settings. - There are other more suitable areas in the site which could be development but there is no convincing justification as to why such options are deemed unsuitable. <p><u>First Consultation (May 2021)</u> Objection</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Demolition of the curtilage listed Old Dairy would have a detrimental impact on the setting of the listed Foxcombe Hall - The harm to setting would be increased by the development of this area of the site with three new buildings and do not see adequate justification has been provided for this - Combined impact of proposed buildings and alterations to existing continue to amount to overdevelopment of the site

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Remain unconvinced that the amount of development proposed is an appropriate approach to take in the context of this listed building - The scheme would cause unjustified harm to the listed Foxcombe Hall and further revisions are needed <p><i>Officer Note: Comments submitted to the previously withdrawn application ref. P18/V1964/FUL have been provided alongside this consultation response and are available on the website.</i></p>
Layla Moran MP	<p><u>Second Consultation (March 2022)</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Have been contacted by numerous constituents who are extremely concerned about the impact that this proposed development will have on their community and local environment - Share residents' concerns and ask their objections are thoroughly considered and addressed <p><u>First Consultation (November 2021)</u> No response received</p>

3.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

3.1 [P20/V0214/FUL](#) – Refused (22/10/2020)

Conversion of residential house to allow B&B accommodation for academics visiting Peking University

[P19/V2586/DIS](#) - Approved (20/11/2019)

Discharge of condition 8 - bat licence and registration of the site of planning application P17/V3013/FUL.

(Extension and alterations to provide 10 en suite rooms for visitors accommodation (as amended by drawings received 22 January 2018)

[P19/V1798/DIS](#) - Approved (17/09/2019)

Discharge of conditions 4(materials), 5(joinery), 6 (louvre & flue) & 7(landscaping) on P17/V3013/FUL.

(Extension and alterations to provide 10 en suite rooms for visitors accommodation)

[P18/V1964/FUL](#) – Withdrawn (30/08/2019)

Demolition of the existing 'Laboratory Building', and redevelopment to provide a purpose built student accommodation facility of up to 91 study rooms, subterranean teaching space, dining areas, gymnasium, and a 196 seat lecture theatre, including alteration to an existing administrative building and the provision of a publicly accessible cafe and WCs, to serve as an Oxford campus for PHBS-UK (amended transport statement received 6th August 2019).

[P18/V1242/LB](#) - Approved (13/08/2018)

Construction of temporary timber shed for on-site storage during building works phase currently underway.

[P18/V1241/FUL](#) - Approved (13/08/2018)

Construction of temporary timber shed for on-site storage during building works phase currently underway. (Retrospective)

[P17/V3013/FUL](#) - Approved (02/02/2018)

Extension and alterations to provide 10 en suite rooms for visitors accommodation (as amended by drawings received 22 January 2018)

[P17/V3365/DIS](#) - Approved (01/02/2018)

Discharge of conditions 3 - materials and 4 - materials on application ref. P17/V2693/FUL & P17/V2694/LB
Enclose courtyard with glass atrium, relocate entrance, replacement of windows and internal refurbishment.

[P17/V2694/LB](#) - Approved (01/12/2017)

Enclose courtyard with glass atrium, relocate entrance, replacement of windows and internal refurbishment.(as amended by drawings received 8 November 2017 and 19 November 2017).

[P17/V2693/FUL](#) - Approved (01/12/2017)

Enclose courtyard with glass atrium, relocate entrance, replacement of windows and internal refurbishment.(as amended by drawings received 8 November 2017 and 17 November 2017).

3.2 **Pre-application History**

[P20/V1352/PEJ](#) - Advice provided (17/12/2020)

Demolition of laboratory building and ancillary buildings. Redevelopment and extension to include 60 student bedrooms (Use class C2), dining hall, cafe/shop, gym, extension to lecture theatre, teaching space and study space (Use class F1(a)) and associated external works.

Advice provided that proposed works would amount to inappropriate development in the green belt and very special circumstances would need to be demonstrated. Comments also provided on trees, landscaping, ecology and heritage impact.

[P17/V2515/PEJ](#) - Advice provided (23/11/2017)

Demolition of the existing "dairy building" and redevelopment to provide a purpose built student accommodation facility of up to 118 study rooms, subterranean teaching space, dining areas, gymnasium, and a 210 seat lecture theatre to serve an Oxford campus for PHBS-UK

Advice provided that proposed development would need justification for green belt policy, mitigation for sustainable transport options would be required, heritage impacts, and comments on trees, landscaping, ecology and design.

[P17/V2360/PEM](#) and [P17/V2359/PEO](#)- Advice provided (20/09/2017)
Extensions and Internal alterations to The Lodge. To form 10 new bedrooms and 50 SQM of new extension. New internal alterations to entrance and hall. Addition of new glazed enclosure to rear foyer and walkway.
Advice provided that provision of staff accommodation would be an ancillary use, small scale extension to The Lodge and glazed enclosure would be proportionate.

3.3 **Screening Opinion requests**

P21/V1393/SCR – Negative opinion issued 11 June 2021

Request for Screening Opinion for Change of use from use a non-residential educational institution (use class F1(a)) to a residential university campus (use class C2), the demolition of the old laboratory building and ancillary buildings. Internal and external alterations to listed building. Redevelopment and extension to include 60 student bedrooms, dining hall, campus cafe/shop, gym, extension to lecture theatre, teaching space and study space and associated external works.

4.0 **ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT**

4.1 The wider proposed development constitutes Schedule 2 (category 10 (b) – urban development project) development, the area of proposed development exceeds 1 hectare, and the overall area of the development exceeds 5 hectares. A request for a Screening Opinion was received in 2021 (P21/V1393/SCR) and a negative opinion was given. The Local Planning Authority considers there are no material circumstances to require a rescreening of the proposal and that the proposed development is not EIA development.

5.0 **MAIN ISSUES**

5.1 The main issues are:

1. Internal and external alterations to the Listed Building

5.2 This report should be read in conjunction with the report for associated planning application ref. P21/V1376/FUL which considers the wider implications of the proposed development.

5.3 **Internal and external alterations to the Listed Building**

The internal and external changes proposed to the listed buildings are:

- Demolition of the flat roofed west extension to the service wing
- Internal reconfiguration of the service wing to create a gym at the lower ground floor, new first floor bedrooms, shared kitchen and WCs.
- Additional first floor fire escape within the west wing and removal of external metal fire escape
- Reconfiguration of the Warden's flat in the Tower

5.4 The Conservation Officer advises that the internal layout of the service wing within the West Wing is explicitly excluded from the list description and the proposed works retain reference to the corridor layout as existing whilst

improving and upgrading the bedroom and kitchenette provision. The internal fabric largely consists of modern partitions that have previously formed offices, and it is these modern partitions which are to be altered.

- 5.5 Works to create a new internal fire escape to facilitate the removal of the incongruous external metal stair will result in the removal of a small area of roof and wall material to create a new doorway junction. The Conservation Officer is satisfied that this removal of a minimal amount of historic fabric will not harm the overall significance of the listed building.
- 5.6 The Conservation Officer also advises that the internal changes to the Warden's Flat at level 2 of the Tower are minimal and not considered to harm the historic building. There are no other works proposed to the interior or historic fabric of the main listed building.
- 5.7 The Conservation Officer is satisfied that the works proposed do not harm the significance of the listed building and its fabric.

6.0 **CONCLUSION**

- 6.1 Officers are satisfied that the proposed internal and external changes to the West Wing of the George and Yeates House will not harm the significance of the listed building or its historic fabric.

The following planning policies have been taken into account:

- CP39 - The Historic Environment
- DP36 - Heritage Assets
- DP38 - Listed Buildings

WOOTTON AND ST HELEN WITHOUT NEIGHBOURHOOD PLAN
DG2.1 Heritage Assets

VALE OF WHITE HORSE DESIGN GUIDE 2015

NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK 2021

PLANNING (LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS ACT 1990

Author: Penny Silverwood
Email: penny.silverwood@southandvale.gov.uk
Tel: 01235 422600